**December 12, 2023 Meeting - Seattle Community Technology Advisory Board**

Topics covered included: Portland’s Open Data Day; CTAB Year-End Summary Document; Committee Updates

**This meeting was held:** December 12, 2023; 6:00-7:30 p.m., via Webex and in person

**Attending:**

**Board Members:** Camille Malonzo, Phillip Meng, Coleman Entringer, DeiMarlon Scisney, Femi Adebayo, Omari Stringer, Lassana Magassa, Isabel Rodriguez

**Public:** Dorene Cornwell, Harte Daniels, Hector Dominguez Aguirre, Aftab Farooqi, Lana Tsvihun

**Staff:** David Keyes, Jon Morrison Winters, Eleonor Bounds, Vinh Tang, Cass Magnuski

**16 In Attendance**

**Camille Malonzo:**   Welcome, everyone, to the December meeting. Thank you all for joining. Tonight, we have an awesome tall from Hector Dominguez Aguirre about Open Data Portland, so we are really excited to hear about all of the good stuff that the City of Portland is doing. And then, we're going to do a little draft over our end of year document, as people in the room can have some cookies and sparkling cider and other treats that I see here. And we're going to call that an early meeting. And then we will tee up some things that we can look forward to in January. The first order of business is just the approval of minutes and the agenda. Let's do introductions, and then we can do the approval of minutes and agenda. I will go around the virtual room and then you can give your names, first and last for the minutes, where you are calling from and your affiliations.

**INTRODUCTIONS**

**Camille Malonzo:**   Thank you. Moving on to the last meeting's minutes, which was really helpful to me because I was out sick, and thank you, Cass Magnuski, for those minutes. That was really helpful. Can I please get a motion from a board member to approve the minutes from November?

**Coleman Entringer:**   I move to approve.

**Camille Malonzo:**   Thanks, Coleman. Can I get a second for Coleman?

**Femi Adebayo:**  Second.

**Camille Malonzo:**   Thanks, Femi. All those in favor? All those opposed? All those abstaining? This motion passes. Thanks, all. And then, next up is the approval of tonight's agenda. Can I get a motion from a board member to approve tonight's agenda?

**Omari Stringer:**   I'll make a motion to approve.

**Camille Malonzo:**   Thanks, Omari. Can I get a second for Omari?

**Coleman Entringer:**   Second.

**Camille Malonzo:**   Thanks, Coleman. All those in favor? That is all ayes. This motion passes. We can proceed with tonight's agenda. First up, we will head over to Hector Dominguez Aguirre from the City of Portland to share with us Portland's Open Data Day.

**OPEN DATA DAYS: PORTLAND'S OPEN DATA DAY**

**Hector Dominguez Aguirre:**   Thank you so much for the invitation. I'm also really glad to see familiar faces. We have shared so many things with those participating from Seattle in activities around open data and surveillance technologies. Let me share this screen. I have a presentation.

Open Data Day is an international event, a way to promote access to information from government. It's this idea where governments proactively release information and data, and make data available and accessible. Let me start with Portland, Oregon. We follow what Seattle has done in many ways, but also in trying to adapt to all we need to do locally. We are so grateful for all of the colleagues from Seattle, who have been helping us during our privacy and open data. Six years ago, when I was just starting my job, I went to Seattle a couple of times and having some meetings with folks there, trying to figure out what you have done and how we are doing our own thing and collaborating constantly.

Some numbers you see about Portland: Portland, Oregon has 650,000 residents. We are the 24th largest city in the US. Portland is the whitest city in the US, with 64 percent of people identifying as white. However, that demographic seems to be changing. It's going more in reverse. Fifty percent of Portland residents are experiencing poverty, compared to the 12.4 statewide. Eleven percent of the Portland renters are severely rent burdened and account for 39.3 percent of Portland's retail sales, which is the highest in the US. More workers commute by bike, 6.3 percent, than any other city in the US larger than 150,000 people. And in Portland, we speak English and Spanish, (unintelligible), Somali, (unintelligible). So all of those numbers are actually possible because data is open and available. Those numbers come from central data from data from our own data collection from different sources. We can understand better where we are and where we will be. So, let me share some maps now. You see her four maps. The one top left, that's the dislocation, displacement models that we have for different neighborhoods in Portland. (unintelligible) the more risk for displacement. The ones in purple, they are already gentrified. If you witness some maps with similar models from five years before these, and the ones in blue and purple weren't around back then. At the bottom is a map on economic vulnerability, so we are showing there where the neighborhoods are that are more vulnerable, economically speaking. Then, the one on the bottom right with all the greens, the green map (unintelligible) in Portland. So, you can see by looking at these maps and aggregating all of these different (unintelligible), so through the maps, we can tell stories.

So, the top right map shows a heat dome that we experienced a couple of years ago, and pretty much, those regions were the ones that experienced the hottest locations in our city. As a matter of fact, I live in one of those areas. And we had about 50 people who died in that area and all of the neighborhoods around me. Again, data can tell stories and can actually help us to understand what's happening. It's about intelligence. These are more examples of open data around police, data around transportation and mobility, data about budget and city uses of their many resources. Sometimes it's really inaccessible, all over the place. So, we can be working for quite a while trying to figure out (unintelligible)

.

Open data is data that can be used by anyone. So, we're trying. this is an old analysis that was done in 2015 and things have changed. Right now, we (unintelligible). It puts in a scale how valuable that data is. So, the top one, for instance, in this case was geographic information, environmental information, economic and business information, social information and so on. (unintelligible) Honestly, that doesn't make sense to me, but that's how it is. So, that I would consider an asset. Put a dollar sign there. However, personal data, personal histories (unintelligible)  how data is developed.

Another concept around data, particularly developing a common pool of resources and information when we actually can co-produce. We now have different challenges around governance, responsibilities, policies, and all that. Definitely that helps us to figure out issues around equity, inter-dependence, sustainability, etc. Open data has principles. It needs to be public, accessible, usable. That's definitely really important. It has to be managed (unintelligible) a policy (unintelligible) . I think Seattle has a policy which is open by preference. In addition to that, right now we are talking about semantic information. Data can be leakable, therefore we are moving from how we can figure it out, those leaks. Open data can also be a public and government tool. In the City of Portland, we have these core values: risk, for instance, that the city approved a couple of years ago. Among those is anti-racism, equity, transparency, communication, collaboration, and responsibility. We also are exploring justice and rights as core values for what we do. Another thing that we are trying to do is (unintelligible). Actually, that came a little bit from the privacy surveillance work that we are also doing urban design and urban trends. It doesn't really take much into account (unintelligible), sometimes. It's purely (unintelligible). The same justice tries to put people at the center of what they are trying to develop. It recognizes that (unintelligible) is to be sustained, and empower communities.

So, data in Portland has been used to empower communities. They have been using their own surveys and their own analysis for understanding their housing needs in terms of their communities. And they can advocate on that. This has been used for the Portland clean energy fund, and right now, that's about $1 million for energy, particularly focused on low income and marginalized communities in general. So, before it was approved, they were doing all of these incredible analyses. Some neighborhoods in Portland were using data for understanding displacement. For instance, it has been used to provide some compensation for retribution for people who have been displaced, particularly African American families who for many generations, lived in north Portland, but with gentrification, they were displaced. So, they're trying to help all of those families to come back. And that's just one community analysis.

And the last one is around transportation. So, finding ways to reach communities to move. This was also independent work, where they were understanding what were the needs around transportation along with the Portland Bureau of Transportation created a digital wallet to provide some subsidies to some of these neighborhoods. Research justice is another framework that is based on rights. Research justice is kind of old. It started in Oakland in the mid-90s, I think. It's based n the idea that people in the neighborhoods have a right to know. They have the right to be heard. And they have the right of self-determination. The center in Oakland closed in the late 2000s, I think. But their work laid the framework for the later development of digital justice. In Detroit, I don't know if you are familiar with the Detroit community-built technology (unintelligible). They have done so much work around data, open data. They have open data playbooks. In 2015, they did this open data disco tech, which the city has just approved, and the community tried to do some work. Let me show this video quickly. We would like to take that into Portland.

Since 2021, we have been organizing Open Data Day. We started just with panels, inviting people to share subjects and particular topics, just to create some awareness and to get right in with the idea that the City of Portland should release information. Then in 2022 and 2023, we opened it up and invited more people in the community. And last year, we put together a set of panels. So, the images that you see there are recordings and we have created an archive of different presentations. But also, we put together an Open Data Disco Tech. It was last year. It was well attended by the people who saw the open data available. So, we had Portland neighborhoods be there, the police were there, housing was there, and they could do whatever they wanted to do to explore. That was a really good way to connect with each other. For instance, I got connected with an old colleague from the City of Gresham, who came downtown and started working on some of his ideas. The local branch of (unintelligible), they also joined in this effort in terms of the presentations. Three years ago in 2022, we were talking about procurement data. So, one year passed, and now we are implementing the open data standard. So, city staff and (unintelligible) started looking into all of that. Next year, we are actively transforming completely how procurement data is being managed. And that is very exciting. The 311 program also was presented in 2022 and we are going to start working on the 311 data next year. So, it just takes time and everything needs to grow organically. It all depends on who is there, who is the staff, and how we can just support each other in general. So, that was the Open Data Disco Tech. We actively work with Democracy Lab. Some of you may be familiar with that. this year we were able to work with Democracy Lab because accounting changed the rules and now we cannot pay for that. Here are some pictures from last year's Open Data Disco Tech. That was nice. And we are actually preparing the Open Data Disco Tech for this year on March 2. Yesterday, we got confirmation. We got the big room again in the Portland Building, and we are going to be working towards that.

And with that, I will stop my presentation.

**Camille Malonzo:**   Thank you so much, Hector, for your presentation. I'm opening the floor for any questions or comments.

**David Keyes:**   I'll jump in with a question. This is David Keyes. On the open database, have you picked particular topics for that. And then, can you say something also about how you promoted it and the range of expertise you had in the participants?

**Hector Dominguez Aguirre:**   Yes. It has been indeed open, really. (unintelligible) transportation data, data around public safety. Next year, however, we are going to try to promote (unintelligible) and showcase it. Because at this moment we also want to put some effort in. That's kind of a nice milestone that we can have to showcase or demo some of the developments that we are working on right now. One of the challenges that we have around using technology is that it's really hard to use open source software, even when that open source software is developed internally at the city, it's really hard. So, it's not only that we are going to implement the open data contracting as a standard, we also want to do that as an open source. And we will see how it goes navigating through our policies. That's a great opportunity to explore all of those different challenges.

**David Keyes:**   Can you say something about the range of participants?

**Hector Dominguez Aguirre:**   Yes. Outreach recorded that. We have a range. We work with different organizations, with different communities and we try to do some targeted outreach, particularly in the civic tech community. They know how to work with data. However, we also try to expand that. We were very successful last year in trying to reach out to students, particularly high schoolers as a way to create development. Sometimes, we don't know. We don't have the connection with specific communities, and we can develop volunteers to help me to figure out, and that's how (unintelligible) last year as a small group, a sitting group, and we had some success and we are going to try again.

**Harte Daniels:**   And you had lessons learned. You just mentioned not being able to be successful in one type of outreach. Have you had the time to sit with various groups and figure out what went wrong, what didn't, what could be improved. And have you documented that so that other people can read it? Read your experiences and learn from them? Even if you change your format, or change anything in the program or the event, that historical information is very valuable. I'm wondering if you do a breakdown afterwards of lessons learned, and then allow others who might want to do this, or some of those groups can learn.

**Hector Dominguez Aguirre:**   Yes. I like to do a report after events in the form of a blog post, for instance. I can try to find the blog post. We created a narrative, and within that narrative, some of the lessons are there. I think we can always do better in terms of how to do it. One thing is that open data is not very well-resourced in the city. I am the only one doing open data in the City of Portland. So far, also, I'm noticing privacy, and privacy means (unintelligible). I can do this much. However, we can always do better. One of the lessons learned, too, is that through privacy, we have been in connection with specific groups of people. particularly, we work with some organizations that serve people who are experiencing homelessness, particularly from drugs and evictions and all that. These organizations. And another group that is working with women in east Portland, which is all about displacement and low-income families. This group of Latino women is where they really live. One interesting effect we are having is having collectively, not only with open data but also with digital divide work for these families, with all of the money that is coming and providing computers to many different families, particularly in those areas, in those groups, is that now we have the possibility of connecting efforts. One idea is trying to work with those organizations and groups where everyone can get an interview for how to do that. Using open resources. Using the digital divide and growing along those lines. That is something that we tried last year. I think people weren't very ready. This year, we might try -- and that is because we were asking everybody to come to downtown Portland. This year, we might do something in their communities. We will seek out them and see how it goes. We have some new rules on how to give money in general, but that is the goal. If it doesn't happen this year, hopefully it will happen next year.

**Harte Daniels:**   Thank you. I was just interested in the barriers you found in getting people, doing outreach and actually getting people there. It is to be expected, but this is the first year of events. It slowly grows. But I was interested in hearing of any barriers. Thank you.

**Hector Dominguez Aguirre:**   Yes. One of the biggest barriers, I think, is that sometimes people don't see themselves as these actors. That they can actually learn how to work with data. We heard, actually, last year, that exploring ideas, the effects of merging data and art, for instance, exploring data with advocacy like in Detroit, that it's a matter of capacity sometimes. Collaborating with other organizations. We will see how it goes.

**From Chat:**   from Keyes, David to everyone:    6:39 PM

Thanks Hector for also bringing in the DiscoTech work from Detroit. They are a great model.  Fyi for others, Chris Webb and others from Black Brilliance Research Group here have worked with them.

**Aftab Farooqi:**    during your talk, you mentioned that you are struggling with open source. Is there any way we can help you/ We can definitely help you. We can advise you at no charge. We can help and advise you. If there's anything we can do, we would love to help you. [Inabia Software and Consulting](https://linklock.titanhq.com/analyse?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.inabia.com%2F&data=eJxLtjUzTjVONU-0NE02TjFQS7FNKcqsqspJ1ctLLVHLtU0s9ndKtswP8XRJdFErtk1JLMtM0ctOrUwtVjUxKE5NLCkBKk3PL1Mrss1NTM8rBQkjm1Bqm1FSUlCsauyoauQGROXl5XqZeYlJmYl6yfm5QAEA_RIroA%25%25). I did all of the business part of the company, and have lived in the City of Seattle for a long time.

Lana Tsvihun,  Lana@inabia.com  Aftab Farooqi, Afarooqi@inabia.com

**Hector Dominguez Aguirre:**   Well, thank you so much. I appreciate it. One of the challenges with open source is the opportunity, really. That's what we're trying to figure out right now. We need essentials. Also, we need information around cybersecurity, governance. It's kind of technical. We need to understand how that works. That means the source is sustained, economically speaking, (unintelligible). That's the challenging part for open source.

**Aftab Farooqi:** You mentioned a patent. Is there any way we can get that?

**David Keyes:**  (unintelligible) kinds of terms for that and procurement around the open source.

**Hector Dominguez Aguirre:**   That, and also around open data, for instance Seattle (unintelligible). It's quite expensive and that has been one of the main values for us. We are trying to navigate through existing licenses. Portland has some very intricate IT code systems, and we are trying to figure out that, as well. So, it's a mix between openness and crowd services with all legacies managing data. Particularly, if you go to maps, it's really good. But that's what you see at the top. But inside there are so many different scripts managing sources of information and data from the county, from the state, from the city and it's various different bureaus, and aggregating all of that is a big project.

**Camille Malonzo:**   I see hands from Dorene Cornwell and Lassana Magassa. I'm going to go to Dorene, and then Lassana.

**Dorene Cornwell:**   Do you have any particular projects that you could talk about how to loosen it and how its outcomes are affected? Maybe a story or two?

**Hector Dominguez Aguirre:**   On open data? There are different projects. I wouldn't know how to start in the sense of open data. Open data is a response to transparency, making the data transparent. We are trying to do that because there are so many public records requests. Portland Police Bureau is one of those, and last year they got about 30,000 public record requests. From that, only 10 percent were completed. It's terrible, right? It impacts information and impacts so many different things. We are trying to start from the bottom, and right now, there is an ongoing effort around the governments. I would say from the start to the end, we don't have it yet, and that's okay, because it's an evolution. But at this time, we could be recognizing that there are different challenges, and we need to look at those. Now there is an opportunity.

**Dorene Cornwell:**  Thank you.

**Lassana Magassa:**   Good evening. Thank you for the presentation. My question is particularly with the multi-lingual communities. I was wondering about the testability of data in non-English languages. (unintelligible)

**Hector Dominguez Aguirre:**   So, accessibility is the subject, being able to access different options with those people and people with disabilities in general. From screen readers to designs, having them accessible and all of that. It's a whole process. There is internally, and I'm sure in general, we are trying to create awareness about all of that. In terms of just language-accessible, I don't think we are doing a very good job in general. So I come from Mexico and my native language is Spanish, so I feel the need for that. But beyond that, everything needs some resources and also it needs the counterpart. We have been in a position where until we get the request, we are not going to do it actively. And we are not getting these requests because we are not getting to those communities. So, it's kind of a bad cycle. We will try to break that. Hopefully, we will make more steps this year to try to break that. And we're working with some organizations that service immigrant and refugee communities, for instance, some other communities in general. How they communicate with their own networks is through English, it's a work in progress, I suppose.

**Lassana Magassa:**   Thank you for that. And I have a quick follow-up question. Are there any particular areas of data that would be good places to start? For example, public transportation. Thank you.

**Hector Dominguez Aguirre:**   There are so many different maps where standard data is very standardized. We are about to release a new edition of our neighborhood data, for instance, in Portland. The neighborhood data displays how diverse neighborhoods are in terms of demographics. Race, ethnicity, but also age, economics. education, through employment and unemployment, semi-employment, those sorts of things. Through that I learned that I live in one of the more diverse neighborhoods, for instance. So, I like that. Also, what are the diversities of businesses in town. That's also very important. Data sells as a way to tell stories. We are cutting through all of these slices of data through time and we also can describe the evolution of our own neighborhoods.

**Camille Malonzo:**  Thank you so much, Hector. Do you have links? Or emails so we can contact you?

**From Chat:**  from Hector Dominguez He/Him to everyone:    6:52 PM

This is the program site: <https://www.portland.gov/bps/smart-city-pdx>

**From Chat:** from Hector Dominguez He/Him to everyone:    6:54 PM

however, we don't have the open data blog posts in this new page yet.

**From Chat:**  from Hector Dominguez He/Him to everyone:    6:53 PM

our open data landing page: <https://www.portland.gov/bps/smart-city-pdx/open-data-program>

**Hector Dominguez Aguirre:**   I will do that. Thank you for the invitation. We really owe a lot to Seattle. From the privacy perspective, Ginger Armbruster has been a strong supporter from the beginning. And the privacy team, too. I know now that they also manage open data.

**David Keyes:**   We all learn from each other.

**YEAR IN REVIEW**

**Camille Malonzo:**  Okay. We will get those links and the contact info into the chat. But next up on our agenda, is just a quick preview of our year in review. I think, first of all, I just want to say thank you so much to this board for an incredible year on CTAB. Our focus this year was on internal board capacity building. We were really looking internally, but then also delving into our relationships with our key stakeholders. And I think we did a great job. We also introduced ten new board members, which I think we haven't done in forever. So, thank you all for the energy, the ideas. And also thank you to Vinh Tang, Jon Morrison Winters, David Keyes, Delia Burke, and Brenda Tate, Cass Magnuski, and everyone, because this show wouldn't run without your support. So, just thank you off the top.

Some highlights that we tend to highlight in the year in review are the digital equity grants awardees. These are in yellow because they are from last year, and we're still working on the updates. We will also add in here the awardees from the Digital Navigator cohort grants. I think these are just the TMF grantees for this year. So, we'll add that, as well.

New this year -- and I just want to shout out -- Isabel Rodriguez and Omari Stringer for their participation and work on the Seattle IT's CTO's working group on Generative AI systems. I also saw Eleonor Bounds. Just amazing work there. That was a huge focus in Seattle IT, as well. What came out of that was some pretty good policy. So, thank you all for that work.

One thing that we landed on this year was the mission statement of CTAB, which was a space of discussion for pertinent and important technology topics. So, for example, we welcomed Jim Loter for the CTO officer update. And we welcomed folks from King County on the digital equity planning, and also David Keyes, of course, for his incredible work.

We wanted to engage with folks at the Office of Intergovernmental Relations to bring in insights from Olympia, and important bills that went through the Legislature. We also welcomed Professor (unintelligible) to talk through how to even think about creating policies around Generative AI.

Those are some of the highlights -- oh, and also, most recently we had Aisha Bomani, one of our members, talk through digital equity at Seattle Public Schools. Thank you to the Digital Equity Committee for their great work on last month's telecom forum, where they hosted representatives from AT&T, T-Mobile, and Verizon. This was sent to members and a few of the committee chairs. So, we often have a little section by committees. But these are all from last year. I think the idea was to update this language and we also have elections this January so we can vote and turn it over to our partners at the City.

So that was this year.

**David Keyes:**   In a nutshell!

**Camille Malonzo:**  In a nutshell!

**David Keyes:**   And they had us work on the Technology Access and Adoption Survey.

**Camille Malonzo:**  Oh my gosh, yes. So, we will add that, too. We are also looking for an update on that, as well. I see Lassana Magassa here. If I missed anything, which I'm sure I have, please let me know. Or members can also just edit the document. That would be really helpful.

Next up on the agenda committee updates, public forum, and an early night so that we can celebrate with these cookies. But before we head over to committee updates, this wasn't on the agenda, but I'll just say it anyway. We will be holding off our elections until January. There are three new CTAB members. I will send out more information on how we are doing elections this year, which is not any different than any other year. But if you are thinking about running for chair or vice chair, please start thinking about it and letting either me or Vinh Tang know of your interest. You could also nominate someone that you think would be a great fit for those roles. And those nomination can also be sent to either me or Vinh Tang. But more thorough details will be sent to members in the next few weeks, preferably before January. I think that's it.

I guess the last thing is that this is typically this is my and Tyrone's last meeting, but because of the rules, we will still be here in January. We will throw a little going away thing in January.

**David Keyes:**   Glad to have you again for the next month.

**Camille Malonzo:**  We've just got to host elections. And then, next up is committee updates. So, I'm going to hand this over to Dorene Cornwell, Harte Daniels, and Coleman Entringer for an update from Digital Equity.

**COMMITTEE UPDATES**

**Digital Equity Committee**

**Harte Daniels:**   One of the last outcomes from our last meeting in November, we discussed due to lack of availability of the room, we will not be meeting the last week of December. But the members did commit to working offline with each other on our own document to pull our ideas together for the end of the year summary. We then discussed the after action of the two forums at the end of the year, which was the internet providers' forum and to build a list of questions for City Council candidates. We reviewed how successful we felt, the information, the different format work with the telecommunications providers' forum, how we would like to have that work not stop just with the forum but to continue throughout the year, first by compiling the information given during that meeting, but pursuing the parts of it that were not fleshed out. We would like to try to keep the telecom providers engaged throughout the year, but at least at one point of the year with the Digital Equity Committee. And of course, what worked well; what didn't; or what could be improved. And what it takes out of each of us with this group in creating and putting this on. We did feel that we were being a little more creative than usual in our format. We discussed the questions in the candidates' questionnaires. Because there were some good questions in them, we would like to keep repurposing those and using them as talking points for whatever projects we would come up with during 2024. Again, the assessment went well. What could be improved as far as the document for future reference. And then we just threw out a brain teaser or thought cloud or thought process, which will become a first step for 2024, which is assessing the word, 'equity,' and how the committee wants to incorporate that in our 2024 service. We have been doing this for quite a while, so how would we grow? How would we stretch? We briefly listed other organizations to include their commitment or their presence and experience in improving their equity experience with community, involving them, etc. So, three is some research that we will be doing introspectively, on ourselves, to see how we can improve. Dorene Cornwell, or Coleman Entringer -- I don't know if Phillip Meng is here tonight. Coleman, can you add to any of that?

**Coleman Entringer:**   I think that hits all of the main points that I had. I think it was more of a meeting around reflecting on where we've gone, and we were just articulating that for the report, and then looking forward to action on next year's plans.

**Phillip Meng:**   Thanks, Harte and Coleman. I think that covers most everything. I'm not going to try to talk too much, because I'm working under pretty terrible internet conditions. Sorry that I may have missed some of the earlier pieces. The main thing for the questionnaire that we will be looking to focus on the newly sworn-in Councilmembers, come January. And as a committee broadly, we really want to be proactive. And David Keyes, thank you for your suggestions here. This is a great opportunity and a forward-looking engagement with Councilmembers. That's what is up for next year. But, thanks again, Harte Daniels. I think that was a really great summary of the many balls in the air that we're juggling.

**Harte Daniels:**   For me, the point is that we don't rest on our laurels. Dorene, come on in.

**Dorene Cornwell:**   No, I just was going to say that I don't have anything to add.

**Camille Malonzo:**   Great. Is that all from folks from Digital Equity? I want to say that I don't think this committee has the capacity to rest on their laurels. You all do so much. So, I thank you for an incredible year, and also the thoughtfulness of heading into 2024. Next up, I think, is Outreach, but I saw that the November meeting was cancelled, so I don't know if we will have an update there.

**Femi Adebayo:**   There is no update. The meeting was cancelled.

**David Keyes:**   So, all of the basic work on the Technology Access and Adoption survey, and study results and reports are done. There's a tableau with (unintelligible) to open data, as well, speaking of open data. So, now we're just working on finalizing the web site content and getting our press release together. So, I have that if people wanted some of that content.

**Camille Malonzo:**   Is that press release coming out in the new year?

**David Keyes:**   Yes, I hope in the new year, as soon as we can. I think part of the opportunity there then is we can do something at the CTAB meeting, and we're thinking about doing some sort of public event. And we can invite the Disco Tech folks to come and talk about what it means in terms of internet devices, skills, tech support, privacy and cybersecurity, and what we've heard from the community about those levels and barriers to adoption.

**Camille Malonzo:**   That would be great. Yes.

**David Keyes:**   We are also going to be presenting at the National Digital Improvement Alliance at a conference in February in Philadelphia.

**Camille Malonzo:**   Super exciting. Thank you! Okay, so last but not least, we have public comment. This is an open opportunity for anyone to share your thoughts. I don't know who got there first, but I will go Phillip, then Harte.

**Phillip Meng:**   Just really quickly, I wanted to thank everyone for their support over the last year on the Digital Equity Committee. A lot of what we have done (unintelligible). This is Camille's and Tyrone's last meeting within their terms. Thank you for steering CTAB through some really interesting years.

**Camille Malonzo:**   Thanks, Phillip. I heard a little bit of that, but I'm grateful for your kind words.

**Harte Daniels:**   My comment is basically a follow-up to a comment made in an earlier CTAB meeting. In November, we were announcing that with the closure of some of the (unintelligible). One of those was about being able to connect with the medical providers, etc., over the phone. And instead, they are being required to use video conferencing. So, I have been watching how that has been unfolding on a daily basis. I get to hear people who say they missed their appointments because of technology. They tried, but surprisingly to me, especially since one of my master's work in health care was creating a (unintelligible) forward for their medical records in low bandwidth areas. We modeled that on a lot of what people do in Africa, where they use an infrastructure link to mobile phones. And I'm not seeing them use the knowledge that even smart phones -- they're being stymied. This is a very big question. It's not just a language barrier, and it's not just an old folks thing. So, I want to reach out and say, well, here, go to this place and have them help you install that so you can make use of this appointment. What it has done and one of the consequences when you look at data -- a consequence of this is office visits. Talk to the difficulty for people with accessibility issues getting to doctors' offices being difficult for this population. The real consequences this past week, we ran out of appointments at at least two offices, and that is through the end of January. That has never happened before, so it is throttling access to healthcare. These people don't have someone in their area to turn to for Digital Navigator skills. I see that on the one side, and then I see people, instead of turning away from digital equity, get access to devices, internet, etc., and going instead to workforce development. That is one of the consequences I saw on the effect of lack of digital equity or digital literacy. Oh, and the second was a couple of times I ran into people that are having meetings in the building with Frank Chopp, one of our State legislators about people coming out of homelessness, especially those in recovery and others supporting themselves and the lack of access to shelters and housing. What they've done is they're trying to get support for that and perhaps get some wrap-around services to those people. So, that has been my month, which was a rather busy month. Because we also started support for some of the indigenous work that goes through the month of March. But I was particularly dismayed by seeing the lack of access to healthcare caused by lack of access to technology.

**Camille Malonzo:**   Thanks for sharing. In November we started having that conversation about healthcare access, I guess beginning with Covid. And I think it would be interesting to continue that, maybe as a topic for discussion in the new year. Is there something that we cold do immediately in support of this work, aside from formalizing a discussion and planning?

**Harte Daniels:**   One of the things that I wish that I could do is to give them an easy point of reference for navigation. Most of our navigation is like spread. I sometimes just say, "Do you live near a library?" But I can't go into too much, because that's not the purpose of my calls and interaction with them. It's to make sure that they don't die. And yes, I have often wanted to revisit what we started at the beginning of Covid. As I said, we put out to the various organizations, governmental agencies, etc., assuming they would help, and they did not. So, we could not get our research. Now that Covid is in the rearview mirror, maybe they will be more generous in responding.

**Dorene Cornwell:**   I think this is a good area to get into next year, because it really is every piece of digital equity mapped. Is there some way to connect with somebody? If somebody has a device, so they know how to use it? I know people aging into blindness. We meet up once a month, and right now we have several people who are aging into blindness. And some of them had pretty technological careers, and they know how to use a PC with a screen reader. But one of them last week -- I think he must have gotten an I-Phone when the phones went away. It's like "I hate my I-Phone. It's too complex. I don't know how to use it!" And we talked about a product called the blind cellphone, and people know a few things. We talked about that. And then, I stupidly asked, "Can your caregiver help you?" "No! Of course, not! It's all a mystery to sighted people!" So, when I think about workforce development and matching skills and services with what people want, I think there are different ways we could go with it. I'm glad the topic came up. Healthcare providers -- I did a number of telehealths through the pandemic, and they had to bring somebody on first to make sure that I could the tech. I'm like, no, don't worry about it. But there are still inaccessible portals. People call the advocacy committee and we say, okay, we'll help you prove it is inaccessible, but then you have to get to the software company and say, "You need to fix this."

Speaking of workforce development, I know it's too good for blind people who have applied for customer service jobs at Access, and apparently scheduling software is inaccessible to screen readers. So, one of my validictory comments would be I turned off the access to the Transit Advisory Commission, this sounds like a problem. I know one person's name I don't know the other. This sounds like a problem. How about I send you some info to deal with it, because I feel like I see lots of different parts of the digital inclusion world and digital equity.  Anyway, thank you so much. Thank you all for a great year.

**From Chat:**  from Harte to everyone:    7:20 PM

What I would like is an easy point of contact for patients to get quick digital literacy (download the app and how to connect with it)

**Camille Malonzo:**   Thank you all so much. See you all in January!

**ADJOURNMENT**