**December 13, 2022 Meeting - Seattle Community Technology Advisory Board**

Topics covered included: Conversation with Seattle City Councilmember Sara Nelson; Technology Access and Adoption Study Update; CTAB Year-End Summary

**This meeting was held:** December 13, 2022; 6:00-7:30 p.m., via Webex and in-person in conference room 370 at City Hall

**Attending:**

**Board Members:** Camille Malonzo, Lassana Magassa, Rene Peters, Femi Adebayo, Brandon Lindsey, Annie Shaw

**Public:** Sara Nelson, Dorene Cornwell, Harte Daniels, Isabel Rodriguez, Carl Hiltbrunner, Phillip Meng, Maria McDaniel, Coleman Entringer

**Staff:** Jim Loter, David Keyes, Jon Morrison Winters, Tara Zaremba, Steven Ellis, Delia Burke, Vinh Tang, Cass Magnuski, Aurilee Gamboa

**23 In Attendance**

**Camille Malonzo:**  Let's start! Hi, everyone. Welcome to the December meeting of CTAB. It is cold, but we're in good company. This is my first time meeting in a room. It's been like two, maybe three years. So, this is really nice. I brought some snacks, so we'll have a great meeting today. We have exciting guests during today's meeting, and we're also going to cover our year-end summary, for all of you who have been here this past year. The first order of business is going to be introductions.

**INTRODUCTIONS**

**Camille Malonzo:**  Awesome! Up next in our agenda is the approval of the minutes from November's board meeting. Can I please get a motion from a board member to approve the November minutes?

**Femi Adebayo:**   Motion to approve.

**Camille Malonzo:**  Can I get a second for Femi.

**Brandon Lindsey:**  Second.

**Camille Malonzo:**  Thanks, Brandon. All in favor? All those opposed? All those who abstain? This motion passes. Next up, can I have a motion from a board member to approve tonight's agenda?

**Brandon Lindsey:**  Motion to approve.

**Camille Malonzo:**  And, can I get a second for Brandon?

**Lassana Magassa:**  Second.

**Camille Malonzo:**  All those in favor? All those opposed? All those abstaining? I think I've heard everyone, so the motion passes. We're right on time. We're really excited to welcome Councilmember Sara Nelson to this CTAB meeting. As she said earlier, she is a City Councilmember, and most relevant to CTAB, she is the chair of the Economic Development Technology Committee for City Council. We invited her to talk about this past year and have a conversation with us. Councilmember?

**CONVERSATION WITH CITY COUNCILMEMBER SARA NELSON**

**Sara Nelson:**  Hello, everyone. I first want to start out to say that I am sorry that it has taken me all year to meet with you. So, *mea culpa*. I got really busy really fast. And I'm happy to be here tonight. I will tell you a little bit about myself, and a little bit about my committee work. And then, I have some questions for you, and then you can ask me some.

In case you haven't read my bio, I am a former staffer at City Hall. I worked for Councilmember Richard Conlin from 2002 to 2013, as an LA. And I took two years off in 2008 to 2010 to start a family business, Fremont Brewing. So, I've got City experience, and I'm also a small business owner. But I want to take a break and say that this is where I met Vinh Tang. We worked down the hall from each other as co-LAs.

I asked to chair the Economic Development Committee because, as a small business owner I believe that there's a lot more that the City can do to support small businesses, especially coming out of the pandemic. And I also was assigned Technology and City Light, both of which I have enjoyed working on. I have two sons, 18 and 17, and they think it's kind of funny that Mommy is in charge of Technology, because I don't know that much about technology myself, but I do embrace the tech sector in this town, and I want to know more about how we can partner with the sector on things beyond but including digital equity.

So, my first year of work in my committee, mostly I shepherded legislation from City Light. But the interaction that I've had with the IT has been in discussing and then passing for approval to full Council the Surveillance Impact Reports. That has been pretty much the extent of my interaction with the department. I have enjoyed working with Vinh Tang and Jim Loter to the extent that I have, but I want to next year start initiatives that we can really dive into. And so I attended a meeting, a CTAB meeting, at the beginning of my term. it was focused on digital equity, and there were representatives from T-Mobile, Verizon, and AT&T. And that was an interesting discussion. And subsequent to that, I did meet with the government relations folks, or representatives of each of those companies. And what I learned is that they are interested in opportunities to partner with the City to advance our equity goals and to support economic development opportunities. And so, I am going to be coming back to you and talk about how we can make the most of those overtures for partnerships. Because in general, I believe that the City of Seattle could do more to embrace the resources in the tech sector and partner on initiatives and policy goals that could really help us to meet our climate, equity, economic development, and a whole host of other issues. That is one of the missions that I bring to my community as a small business owner myself, looking for ways to strengthen our relationship with the private sector, to have them help us to excel and be the City that is the most innovative when it comes to using our resources in the private sector, and also advancing initiatives that makes us a smarter City.

So, that's my general outlook when it comes to my work on this committee. One of the questions that I have for you is what opportunities is the City missing. We invested more dollars in digital equity, but you are focused on other policy areas: Smart Cities, Privacy and Cybersecurity. I haven't attended some of the meetings regarding cybersecurity, the inter-departmental meetings, but I am your resource. So, I would like to, maybe at the end of the meeting, talk about -- I'm giving you some time to think about this. Are there ways that -- what are we missing? And how can I work with Director Loter to really use technology to further our policy goals. So that's one question. And I wanted to mention also that I did have a meeting with Mike Fong, who is the Region 10 appointed administrator of the Small Business Administration. And our federal partners are looking for opportunities to help small businesses in the area of technology. And I am working on some ideas that I think that I would like to float with you, how we can put together a model that would utilize private dollars to help small businesses in this City.

One thing that became very clear to me during the pandemic is the disparity that exists between small businesses that have not just access to internet but also have robust web sites that enable them to get through the pandemic through online sales. And I believe that the City can do much more to support our small business community, especially small businesses in neighborhoods where English is not predominantly spoken as a first language. How can the City provide resources to enable them to quickly get a web site and maintain it to help with their business. And so I am going to be working on that a little bit. And again, I welcome your input on that. In general, I believe that we're lucky in Seattle to have the strength of our tech sector, and all of you very committed people who are holding our feet to the fire to make sure that we are pursuing our digital equity goals. And I think that we could do more, and that is what I am here for. I want to be your resource, and I want to work together going forward, now that I've got some experience under my belt, and I'm not operating in reactive mode. I am now moving next year into proactive stance when it comes to my responsibilities in my committee. So, now I will open it to questions, and feel free to answer, or just talk about some of the things I just said in the question that I posed about what opportunities, what initiatives should we be pursuing. Thank you very much, and I will let somebody else moderate from here. Thanks!

**Camille Malonzo:**  Thank you so much, Councilmember Nelson. We’re going to put that question that you posed into the chat, and if folks have a response to that question or other ideas, please raise your hand and then we can moderate ideas from there. I want to say that this group has a great committee structure, where we have Digital Equity subcommittees and Privacy and Cybersecurity, and also our Outreach Committee that are doing really awesome work. In their work we can identify a lot of the topics that you may be interested in, and a lot of opportunities, and I really look forward for CTAB  to work closely with your office over the next year to identify some of them, because we have been doing some soul-searching to identify some projects that we could also support more broadly. I don't know if folks from the Digital Equity Committee can speak to some things that they have been thinking through. I know there are some ideas from the Privacy and Cybersecurity Committee that would be interesting, especially on data ethics and data governance. And then, additionally, I just want to call out the great work that Seattle IT has already done, and continuing to support them and all of their awesome work on all of the fronts, especially around digital equity and security. They've been awesome.

**Sara Nelson:**  I forgot to say one thing. I do mean to appreciate publicly Seattle IT, because I has always been a huge fan of the Seattle Channel. And now that I am on the other side of the camera, I recognize that this is a tremendous asset that the City has, the award-winning Seattle Channel. And I watch it for fun. So, I did want to say that a lot of what this department does, nobody recognizes, because it runs so smoothly, and it is behind the scenes, obviously. So, I just wanted to give a shout-out to the folks who enable that kind of access to the public to policy-making vis a vis the Seattle Channel. Sorry to interrupt. I just wanted to make sure to get that in.

**Camille Malonzo:**  They're great, yes, totally.  I think Carl has asked a question in chat. Go ahead, Carl.

**From Chat:** from Carl Hiltbrunner to everyone:    6:25 PM

Can the city and Seattle IT partner with King County Regional Homeless Authority to get broadband access to their locations in the city of Seattle?

**Carl Hiltbrunner:**   Sure. Yes. I have two questions. The first I was asking was looking for how the City might be able to partner with King County Regional Homeless Authority. I know they've acquired a few locations downtown. There's the hotel in Uptown, and there's the Inn on Fifth Avenue. It looks like an opportunity for potential partnership to get folks connected and get folks access there. I was wondering if anybody has looked into that?

**Sara Nelson:**  Are you asking that to me?

**Carl Hiltbrunner:**   Maybe just throwing it out there.

**Sara Nelson:**  That is an excellent idea. I think that's exactly what I was saying. On our biggest challenges, there's got to be a way that we can leverage technology to help. I don't know the answer to your question, but I do know that there are a lot of smart people in this town. There are a lot of resources, and I am just wondering how to connect the dots. Because a lot of what my job is, is dot connecting. I happened to go to this very small gathering of Blockchain people. This was months ago, before the recent scandal. But a lot of them were talking about how it's not just Crypto. It is also that that technology can be used for really complex, multi-layered problems. So, I have often thought about why can't there be real-time information that our outreach providers have on a laptop, with resources that are available right now? A menu of housing options that people living in encampments could, if they wanted to, expect to move into. So, real -time resources, technology-enabled, is just one example. I know that Mark Dons has set up the command center. I think that that would be a good thing for me to ask them, to what extent are they relying on technology, and are they ways in which their processes can be facilitated with more and better use of technology. So, I think that I answered a little bit of your question, which is real-time information to help people right now. It's not just getting them into a housing option, it's also communicating with other service providers, case managers, etc. So, I'm going to make a mental note to follow-up on that. Thank you.

**Harte Daniels:**   You might start with reading the minutes from the last months.

**Sara Nelson:**  Okay, I'm going to do that. Thank you, Harte.

**Harte Daniels:**   Because there was an effort from a small group that was funded, trying to take on something that DEI had looked at, or SIT's diversity group a few years ago. Of the people that the public sector is trying to assist, you have to keep reading all of their paperwork. And so we had this discussion at that point. I was mentioning trying to collaborate, rather than reinventing the wheel, to look at some of the other tools that King County and others have been using, such as Unite Us. In other words, these technologies already work and exist for people that are high on Blockchain, or work on Blockchain. It's used to verify and track information. An example would be in your supply chain, so that you can verify what it is. So, if you were to substitute some of the public sector issues, such as homelessness, that technology would then be able to try to track and verify actual availability. If somebody were to use current technology to try to find availability of space for someone who needs shelter, by the time they go to apply for it, it may be filled. But with Blockchain, instead of starting over, i would suggest a review of cross-collaborations such as what Carl Hiltbrunner was suggesting, to be more efficient and to actually help people.

**Sara Nelson:**  Yes. We don't have time to reinvent the wheel here, I want to know best practices that exist in other cities. I want to know what technology could be deployed for immediate use, and just start right now. So, I will read the last meeting's minutes, and pursue conversations with people who can help me in this department. Now, just for my notes, Unite Us? Is that what you said?

**Harte Daniels:**   Unite Us is the new name for what was Aunt Bertha. And Aunt Bertha was created for the healthcare industry for referrals, etc. And if you check into exactly what the healthcare industry and HHS is requiring -- they are now asking to track determinants of health. When you look at those determinants of health, you will see the issues of equity, issues that you, as a councilmember, are facing. And that's another way we can borrow from another sector. There was quite a bit of work done by the healthcare sector that was out in the community during Hurricane Sandy. We had to rely on some of their knowledge, but the essential determinants of health tracking is newer. Some of the last things that the Obama administration is probably being pursued now. We can talk about that later. When you're looking at some of your comments limited English proficiency, business, etc., I would like to say -- again talking about DEI's work from 2022 is an interest in how do you employ equity in that. That is a longer conversation. The last was your comment saying that with Verizon, T-Mobile, AT&T, we have Coleman Entringer on the line, who helped organize that telecom conference in the room. Across the street was Brandon who presented that to DELN. And what we have been noticing is those three telecom companies are not quite executing the ACP the way that would bring results that the public sector would want. We haven't yet begun to look at that, but asked that these communities be part of the conversation in our 2023 questions to the telecoms. So, Brandon is right there. I think this is his last month as a CTAB member, but he can probably address this right now. Sorry to be long-winded. But we have been discussing these things and welcome your interest.

**Sara Nelson:**  Thank you. Steven, can you put my contact information in the chat so that people can easily reach me if they have other thoughts after this conversation. Who is next?

**From chat:**  Ellis, Steven to everyone:    6:37 PM

Hi everyone! Please reach out to Sara.Nelson@Seattle.gov

**Camille Malonzo:**  Do you have time?

**Sara Nelson:**  I do have one question. I was at the University District Partnership board meeting a couple of days ago. And people brought to my attention that there are buildings within the heart of the U-District that don't have enough internet capacity to really function well. Sometimes the connections are too slow to actually do business. That was surprising to me, because there are a lot of labs. How can we have an area in our City that is so lacking in what is needed to not just run businesses, but also in home offices and the residents around there. Plus, there are labs and it's the center of science and technology. That is one example of a problem that was brought to my attention. I was going to forward it to the department and also to City Light. Apparently, it's a fiber issue, but I acknowledge that that problem exists elsewhere in the City. So, I will follow-up with you, or maybe Vinh Tang and I can talk, or Jim Loter, to address something like this. But, are you aware of this being a geographically pervasive problem across the City, or is it something unique to there?

**Camille Malonzo:**  I think this is a question to the room. I think there is some data from the Internet for All work that can corroborate some of that experience where there are regions in Seattle that don't have internet in those neighborhoods. I think Delia Burke can probably speak to that data. But, yes, I don't believe it's just the U-District, but there are programs trying to address these gaps.

**Jim Loter:**   This is Jim, and if I've got a minute, I can speak to that. What I believe from what you were saying is that you're talking about multiple-dwelling units or potentially, buildings with multiple businesses operating in them. As many folks on this call know, the FCC just recently revised and published a new broadband coverage map with vastly improved data provided by the internet service providers in the City. But one gap that still exists is drilling down into those multi-tenant buildings. The City of Seattle, along with several dozen, if not even more than that, public agencies just signed on to a letter to the FCC, urging them to revise the process for collecting data at that level, because as it is now, it looks like if Verizon or any other service providers, provide service to a building or an address, there is nothing that shows how pervasive or how distributed that service is throughout that building. And that's a serious gap for the types of construction that you're talking about, and the types of units that we know that a lot of affordable family units, and a lot of multiple dwelling units throughout the City are in that state. So, we are actively trying to encourage things that the FCC at the federal level to improve the data that we have available, so we can better pinpoint where those problems are. And we have worked with FCCI. We have worked -- that's the Department of Construction and Inspections -- and other departments in the City, just exploring options. We've done extensive training with developers, and tried to educate them about what they can do in the buildings that they own and support to encourage multiple providers and better service, and better access throughout buildings. In some cases, it's an education process. They don't know that they need a bigger conduit, for example, to get into a building to allow multiple providers in there. So, we're kind of doing what we can under our authorities, and influences, I guess you'll say. But we do know that it's a challenge and probably something that's going to require some collaboration, if you will, with the private sector to encourage better infrastructure throughout those buildings, and better access to service. But yes, certainly, we would be happy, Councilmember, to put that on our next agenda there to discuss with you.

**Sara Nelson:**  Great! Thank you very much.

**Camille Malonzo:**  Thank you so much, Councilmember Nelson for joining us tonight and for a great conversation that we had around opportunities and initiatives. And we can probably work with you in the new year. We hope to engage more thoughtfully in the new year around ways that we can partner.

**Sara Nelson:**  Thank you. And I want to thank all of you for your service, your volunteers, and for taking this on out of the goodness of your hearts, your interest, and your engagement. So, thank you very, very much for your work and your expertise. And if somebody could send me the transcript of the chat, that would be helpful, because I can't walk and chew gum when it comes to online meetings. So, thank you. Bye, everybody. Good night.

**Camille Malonzo:**  We want to wrap our heads around more data, better understanding of how technology works and doesn't work in our City. I think that's a great segue to our Technology Access and Adoption Survey update from David Keyes.

**TECHNOLOGY ACCESS AND ADOPTION SURVEY UPDATE**

**David Keyes:**   Great! Thanks! Yes, this does tie together, in terms of the mapping and who has what access. I'm going to take a few minutes and do an update on the work we've been doing on the Technology Access and Adoption Survey. A brief moment just around the background for those who aren't familiar. This is something we've done every four years that measures the levels of technology access and use; the challenges of the internet, and it also looks at barriers to technology adoption and skills.

CTAB was pretty involved in the early part of this. Brandon Lindsey and Lassana Magassa have been CTAB members on our planning work. Since the last update, we've been working hard on two things. We've been working with a vendor, Pacific Market Research, to revise the survey that we did in 2018, and to complete that survey. We got some really great input from Brandon and Lassana, CTAB members, on the housing authority, a research project, the University of Washington, library staff, State library, Seattle schools, our staff. We've been doing a lot of hacking through on those questions. There are some really interesting and challenging ones about how do we ask what level of service people have, and what level of satisfaction they have with their internet service. A new question that we're asking this year is have people had an interruption in service, or the slowing down of service. That's something that has come up in our digital skills list. We did not ask previously about whether people were comfortable using Zoom and Teams and Google Hangout. So, bringing those kinds of things in. so, this week we're finalizing that survey instrument, and then we'll be putting that out in January. I don't have the exact date yet, that might shift a little bit. We've also been talking with Seattle Public Schools, so we are collaborating with them to be able to do a focus sample of some of the more diverse and low-income school lunch eligible sites. And to also do an email survey to Seattle Public Schools’ families households again. And then we're working with the Seattle Housing Authority outreach to do a strong sample of those folks. And one of the things that we're all excited about is this time, we're including both people who live in the public housing buildings, but also, we'll be able to reach out and distribute the surveys to some of the folks that are in the subsidized scattered site housing. So, that helps us with a broader reach. And then lastly, the quantitative survey: We are working with the Tribal Technology Training Group to aim for a goal of a minimum of 100 surveys to be completed by indigenous tribal community members, so that we can, for the first time, have a decent sample from representation of that community. There is more work to do in the details of that, but we're really excited about that, as well.

And then, the other piece is that we do have enough funding to do at least four focus groups. So, we've been looking at what those are, and trying to get a combination of underserved representatives who will give us input that we may not get, a little depth that we may not necessarily get from the quantitative survey. And we are just in the final stages of signing a contract with Inclusive Data. They are the group, along with another group from the Black Brilliance Research Project that Brandon and Lassana and I worked with on the phase one part of this that did some great community engagement. So, we'll fold in some of the input they got in the first design phase from, I think it was 247 interviews that they did in that first stage, along with focus groups in this second stage. So, we're real excited to work with them again, as well. And if we can get additional funding, then we'll expand that number of focus groups.

We had a little bit of discussion with the State Broadband Office, and we'll be floating a proposal to them to see if they might allow us to expand that. I think that's the main update. The sampling work, the data collection, will happen January through March. In April and May, we'll be working on the data analysis and starting on reporting. And then, towards the end of June or July will be when we complete the report, the data table, the data dashboard, and be able to report out.

That's a synopsis of what we're doing. John, or Brandon, or Lassana, do you have anything else to add to that.

**From chat:**  Keyes, David to everyone:    6:40 PM

WA State Commerce web site about the mapping challenge and how one can challenge the data: <https://www.commerce.wa.gov/building-infrastructure/washington-statewide-broadband-act/fcc-broadband-mapping/>

**Brandon Lindsey:**  That was great, David. Good summary!

**Harte Daniels:**   Thanks to all of you for all of your work in the broadening of inclusivity and equity in just doing this report. That's a massive task. I give a lot of appreciation to you.

**David Keyes:**   Thanks, Harte. I appreciate that. And I think that certainly supports our community and gives us a better one down the road.

**Camille Malonzo:**  Thank you all so much. I echo that appreciation. Do folks have any questions? Just put them in the chat, and we can get them to the folks who are involved in this project.

**David Keyes:**   Actually, Harte asked about whether it is time to resurrect the broadband speed tool. He asked about that in the chat on the mapping piece. That question again will come up about how many people understand what speed they have. So, I think that that is certainly something that I think we'll talk about a little bit in all of this and come out of it with a good CTAB discussion, just about if we were going to do more to promote speed testing, how should that be framed. How do people do that? There's been a lot of discussion, as we were talking about, about capturing the single moment in time, versus doing a series of tests from a location, time of day, how to properly do a speed test, which could be a whole education campaign on how to properly do that, as well.

**Brandon Lindsey:**  Sometimes I think that taking a speed test is like if you watch a show on Netflix at 8:00 p.m. To explain that to people is really hard. Like that kind of stuff when a practical tool -- is it there to do the things you want to do? I don't know.

**Harte Daniels:**   Yes, that's why David mentioned that it takes some discussion. But again, returning to equity, you are empowering the people. I mean yes, a techie may be able to grasp it early, but if you were to empower the people with citizen science themselves to advocate for themselves, and to say, hey, this is not working. You have all of these scheduled dollars for X, Y, Z, or you say to the telecoms that you installed these things, but we're not receiving it. To empower them and to find a way to communicate such a technical matter so that they can do as a citizen scientist and do the reporting themselves, it might mean that you would have to then do a follow-up with a different-skilled person, but again, equity, putting the power back in the hands of the people.

**David Keyes:**   As we were thinking about in the survey, certainly our goal is to get information that we can act on. In a sense, we're getting at some of that 'can you watch Netflix' in a couple of different ways with that. We are asking folks who have been without internet for a while. We're asking why you don't use it more. It being slow and frustrating is one of those choices. Just to mention, too, we're also asking about the awareness of the low-income internet programs. And we're also asking what kind of training people would like as an open-ended option. That will also help tell us.

**Harte Daniels:**   Yes, the question of 'can I watch such and such on Netflix' at such and such a time is like 'can I even afford Netflix?' Is that the actual question?

**David Keyes:**   That's certainly a factor of where that complexity of your service comes into play. We had a lot of discussion about how to list the services. And we are asking people about their overall -- to tell us the best they can how much they're paying overall for their service. And then we're just asking if their package includes other things besides internet. But it does get pretty complicated pretty quickly. And also with the increase in options between mobile and fixed internet.

**Cass Magnuski:**  Do people not understand that they can go and ask Google what is my speed? There are several sites out there. One of them is fast.com, for example. And it will just tell you.

**Harte Daniels:**   That's what we're discussing, whether the people that we're trying to service have the knowledge to understand. Even if they go to these things, what is it saying. And by the way, props to Brandon Lindsey. I know that he was describing that in his example. I know that he deeply understands this question, and I didn't mean to rag on him.

**Brandon Lindsey:**  We are entering the fray, and I don't want this to be disrespectful.

**David Keyes:**   Yes. I don't understand those speed tests, and what they give you, and those kinds of things. That may be something just to put on the parking lot for topics for CTAB for 2023. There could be a speaker talking about that and a discussion.

**Rene Peters:**   I'm just going to ask a quick question about terminology. We're talking about different things: Netflix, access to internet, (unintelligible)... messaging on low usage, browsing the internet being the next tier, and then (unintelligible). These seem to be the things that a lot of folks use that we might be able to take advantage of, at least to categorize some of the feedback that we get. Or, at the very least might be a way that people understand. Just something to think about.

**David Keyes:**   Interesting about that grouping, because we do ask about what you're comfortable with, and we ask about what are the kinds of things you do online. Some of those are higher bandwidth than others, so they could potentially be groups. We had that discussion a lot, actually, about health access, and to what degree we should be asking about health use and telehealth-related questions. We looked at some of the other research around the country being done on that. We arrived at a few things. Because the different levels in that tend to be -- there's the piece about can I make an appointment with my doctor, to can I actually have an appointment with the health practitioner online. And also, can I access and use online health records. There was a topic area that we actually left off. We don't think it's quite right. It's the actual use of the internet for remote health monitoring, which is still growing and emerging. Some of those are lower bandwidth, actually, than others, but that's sort of a fourth, another category that we saw emerging in the telehealth field.

**Harte Daniels:**   I have a lot of resources that I can guide your towards, if you wish, but you are correct. That is more of a complex question. And as to Rene's questions about a breakout on the services, Brandon was there with the group and what they are facing with their people so maybe even checking with some of the CBOs that applied for the TMF, whether they received it or not, on couching these questions. Brandon is a resource for that because he was present for the presentation in November for the DEI.

**David Keyes:**   Okay. We are excited to get the questionnaire done, because part of the next step is getting translators.

**Camille Malonzo:**  Thank you so much, David, for that update. We're really looking forward to the next steps in this project.

**David Keyes:**   Thanks. And again, big shout-out to Brandon and Lassana for really taking some time to do this.

**Camille Malonzo:**  The next item on the agenda is a review of CTAB's work in 2022. I'm trying to get my screen up. In the meantime, if folks in the room want to grab a snack, or folks on Webex want to grab a stretch break.

**Vinh Tang:**   Camille, I can put it up there.

**CTAB YEAR-END SUMMARY**

**Camille Malonzo:**  Okay, that will be awesome. Thank you so much, Vinh. This is definitely a draft of the awesome things we've done this year. At the top, I just want to say thank you to our board members for their engagement and their awesome work. Brandon and Lassana did awesome work. I just want to thank you all for an awesome year. It has been really productive. As Councilmember Nelson said, we really appreciate your engagement. And thank you so much to Seattle IT for being amazing. Special shout-out to Vinh Tang, Meira jough, Delia Burke, for being our liaison. This literally would not run without any of you, so we are so appreciative for all of your work. And also Cass Magnuski. Thank you, Cass, for doing the minutes. I can't believe I forgot you. We appreciate all of you.

So, I just want to go down and highlight some of the accomplishments of the past year. Again, the City of Seattle was recognized as a Digital Inclusion Trailblazer, again meeting the six criteria. We're not alone this time. I think I've counted about nine other cities that managed to get on that list. So, thank you. That is really a testament to the work of Seattle IT and DELN, and all of the awesome digital equity folks around the City, to have achieved such recognition.

And then we also had a showing for the digital equity brands, expanding the program with the Digital Navigator program this year. So, that you so much to Meira Jough and all of the digital advisers for all of their awesome work, as well as the 18 members who were review panelists. I was ne this year. It was just so eye-opening to read through all of the applications. Unfortunately, there were about 53 or so individual proposals, but only 19 or so were actually funded. But they all were really creative solutions for device access, digital skills training, and internet connectivity across the City. All of the projects within all of the Council Districts, reaching over 5,000 City residents. And we're really looking forward to seeing all of the awesome work from these organizations with the TMF grants, as well as Digital Navigator for our grants this year. So, thank you to all those involved in this.

I wanted to also highlight the speakers and the conversations that we've had this year. i think we speak a lot about digital equity in CTAB. I wanted to focus this year on really sharing the lived experiences of what that actually means. So, we're really excited to hear from different committees and community members throughout this year. I think we started the year off amazingly with the telecom forum thanks to the Digital Equity Committee, which organized the forum, then produced a collated compilation. It has been brought to the DELN, and also put on the web site. I think it's really comprehensive. I've actually shared it with a few of my friends who needed it and thought it was awesome. So, thank you so much for the work there. We also invited Lassana Magassa and Douglas French to talk about how incarcerated people experience digital literacy, and what the challenges are there. And we also wanted to highlight Will Booth from T-3 tribal technology training, who spoke to what digital equity and digital training looks like through cultural awareness. So, we thought that was really awesome to hear in this room. And then also, folks from Seattle IT teaching us about Data Governance 101, and what has been happening at the Privacy Office; what has been happening with Internet for All. They gave us City Cybersecurity 101, Civiform last month; David Keyes always keeping us up to date with state and national digital equity legislation. So, I wanted to say thank you all for a really engaging year of CTAB meetings.

This next slide is highlighting some of your work from our committees, which is still in draft. We will finesse the language and take this up to the January meeting to vote on the final. And then we will submit the final language to the appropriate stakeholders who will be interested in the work that we have done here over the past year. Just top of mind, I think if I could give it to some of the chairs to speak a little bit to what they've done in the past year. I think first up is Coleman Entringer and Harte Daniels on some highlights from the Digital Equity Committee.

**Harte Daniels:**   Okay. Let me see if I can get to what I sent you in an email. Basically, I've been writing bullets and have been asking the team members to contribute. I think Dorene Cornwell has dropped off the call. Katia is not here. By the way, I was also on that review for the TMF. You've already mentioned some of it, and all I can do, basically, is to read the bullet points, some of which you've already mentioned. Coleman did the great bit of organizing and moderating the 2022 telecom representative forum with Philip leading the consolidation. And we made that available to the broader CTAB and COBs. Community members attended DELN meetings, especially the one with the FCC representative. Committee members presented the telecom findings to DELN. That would be Brandon and Philip. Community members testified to the Washington State Legislative Committee on behalf of funding for Digital Navigator programs. We submitted a DEI Committee-endorsed letter of support to the City Council regarding digital equity amendments to the City budget. You already mentioned our participation in the TMF reviews. On September 14, community members did outreach to CBOs doing digital equity work related to employment development during the pandemic. We informed them of CTAB, Team F, and DELN work. By the way, one of the groups that was gathered there was a City agency, and they thought CTAB had been retired. So, whoever is doing outreach, I can try to look that up for you. And then the members held several meetings of various TMF recipients with the goal of increasing cross-collaboration in a more efficient use of the TMF funds. We have been able to cross-connect and generate some interest in those groups working together, and actually helping them in areas where they have strengths to match with persons in other groups' weaknesses. There has been quite a bit of conversation generated that way amongst the CBOs. Committee members have attended Imagining a More Equitable Future of Work, which was held at the UW Evans School of Government and Public Policy on Wednesday, October 19, at the UW longhouse, called Intellectual House, with April Sims, president of the Washington State Labor Council, Wanda Nelson, who is the CEO of Diversity Window, a consultant on building meaningful diversity equity in recruiting goals. And Mardia Shands, a chief diversity, equity, and inclusion officer at Swedish Health. This was attended by many digital equity and inclusion officers in both the public and private sectors throughout the greater Seattle area. I am awaiting other input from the other committee members and we will try to make our language a little bit more concise. You can give us guidance as to what you are seeking and how much you can use.

We have already started our discussions on 2023, even looking at how effectively the ACP is actually being applied. And looking towards 2023 telecom representatives meeting, where we include the questions and participation from the actual community that is being served, as opposed to just being represented by this committee. And there is one other large concept that we are still studying, to work on for 2023. Thank you.

**Camille Malonzo:**  Thank you so much, Harte. That's a lot, and so appreciated. We also look forward to 2023.

**David Keyes:**   Just a really quick nod at one thing. I'm not sure I heard it. Philip Meng and Brandon Lindsey, from the committee also presented to a number of digital equity stakeholders at the Digital Equity Learning Network meeting, presenting the results from the telecom research. And also of note is that the State legislation that folks testified on did pass, so it resulted in that passing of a State digital equity bill earlier in the year.

**Harte Daniels:**   Yes, I did mention their participation, but it might not have been clear enough language. We have been trying to make the DELN more well-known amongst these CBOs, so that they can take advantage of that great work. But yes, thank you. If my language wasn't clear enough, that's why we need to go over that list and make it amenable to your uses.

**David Keyes:**   Yes, I'm sorry if I missed that. There was a lot there.

**Camille Malonzo:**  Yes. Thank you so much. So, Nicole Espy was the chair of Privacy and Cybersecurity. Thank you, Lassana and Isabel, for stepping in this month. Just as an overview for some of the work that was headed by Nicole was really looking at these four key technologies that were pretty hardy in terms of their impact on the community. The committee successfully submitted a public comment on those technologies. And then, working with other folks in the Privacy Office, they looked at some database work as well as a retrospective on some kind of feedback on the perspective of CTAB's Privacy and Cybersecurity Committee on the Surveillance Ordinance. Do Lassana and Isabel have something to add? I think it was a great year in terms of Privacy and Cybersecurity.

And last but not least, we are very excited to have started a new committee this year. So, we want to have Femi Adebayo talk about the Outreach Committee.

**Femi Adebayo:**   This year, one thing we thought about as we were reviewing the committees we have, and were looking for ways of providing some sense of collective efforts regarding CTAB. And we decided to come up with an engagement committee. And the purpose of this committee is to provide some kind of promotion for CTAB, basically looking for what is CTAB doing in terms of initiating policies, and programs. What programs can we engage in, and promote on behalf of CTAB and the City of Seattle to see how we can process some civil engagement or policy engagement around the Seattle residents, which in a way, CTAB represents. We looked at a couple of ideas we had planned in terms of how we wanted to engage. We had three pillars, which were educate, engage, and promote the board. Unfortunately, and obviously, we are trying to now recruit more folks to join so we can have a committee and get traction in terms of doing that. So, my hope is that as we move into the new year, we are able to get a line on this proposal of this committee, and also get more members to join in the spirit of picking up ideas and helping us to shape this committee. Because I think the intent is really to see how we can do a broader outreach for CTAB, and also, we can foster different programs around CTAB. I think someone mentioned earlier that people think CTAB does not exist. Things like that are very important in showing some sort of activity from committee members and showcase what we do, and how we can also engage and foster programs around the committee, and how we can develop programs that help us engage the committee. So, that was the intent of the committee. Obviously, we didn't get traction during the year in terms of committee engagement and having people join. Hopefully, our plans for next year will have more engagement, and programs around the objectives of the committee, so we can move forward and be able to execute some of the ideas we have.

**Camille Malonzo:**  Thank you so much, Femi, for starting the Outreach Committee. We are really looking forward to seeing it evolve in the new year. It's really important to promote what CTAB does. we do awesome things. So, thank you to all the committees for all of your work.

So, that really wraps up 2022. Before we close, we're going to head into committee updates and public comment. We have three outgoing members this month. Actually, you are staying on for an interim month. We just wanted to thank Rene Peters, Brandon Lindsey, and Lassana Magassa an awesome two, maybe four, years on CTAB. All three of you have done amazing work in different capacities for CTAB. You've all contributed so much, not just for CTAB, but also for the benefit of so many community members across our City. So, thank you all so much.

**Femi Adebayo:**   You guys have been so valuable to CTAB, and actually, Rene Peters was actually one of the folks when I wanted to join CTAB that I spoke to, and he encouraged me to join. I had looked at what he is doing and what he has done, as a public speaker. So, you might want to start charging a fee to do public speaking soon. Just kidding. But he urged me to join and I'm really impressed with his stance around poverty and obviously tech, and how he carries himself. And also how he helps others. I could always talk to him about things (unintelligible). He was always helpful in terms of doing that and always providing guidance around that. So, thank you, Rene. I wish you could stay for another term. We will definitely be in touch. Just thank you all for the important work you've done. I really appreciate it.

**Camille Malonzo:**  I just want to give a shout-out to Lassana and Brandon. You do so many things. Lassana, I remember a week ago, we were at (unintelligible), and you were calling in from Sudan! And I was so thankful that you were on the call to talk about CTAB. That's just one of the many things that you were willing to do. So, just thank you, Lassana, for your engagement, your incredible expertise. I have learned so much from you, and you're always so generous with your time, not just for me, but also other people in public policy, because you are truly an expert in that field. So, thank you so much, Lassana, for your engagement here at CTAB.

**Femi Adebayo:**   Yes, thank you, Lassana, for all of your expertise. You were always willing to get on a call and willing to help out. Your work will be missed, and obviously we will definitely keep in touch. Hopefully, if you plan to run for office, let us know. But definitely keep in touch. Thank you so much.

**Harte Daniels:**   Again, I have a high appreciation for Brandon Lindsey, who has contributed greatly to the Digital Equity Committee. He has dedicated a large number of years in his career, too. I'm sure he could have taken a different career path and made even more money, but now that he's a Mariner, don't forget us. He has been there in the trenches, helping people from the ground up to the high level of diplomatic contribution, and astute questions that he brings, and guidance that he brings. He's a little too quiet to get in on the fray sometimes, and that's because he's such a nice guy. And I have to cool my jets and make sure that everybody on the team is heard, but I deeply respect your feet on the ground, not coming in at a high level, but actually having done work from the ground up with the people. That just cannot be duplicated by academia or tech sector experience. Brandon, I very much appreciate it, because it makes you a great advocate, and a person who asks the right, succinct, point-blank questions needed to move us forward, as opposed to just spinning around in a hypothetical (unintelligible). Thank you so much for your experience, and your personality and ability to think of everyone. You are a true servant. We thank you.

**Brandon Lindsey:**   Thank you. Wow. I didn't expect that tonight. This was a lot of work that I did on the part of Goodwill, and a lot of the work that the City has done with digital equity. However many different layers and different selves -- I know that the pandemic isn't over -- but just to see things bouncing back with a lot more engagement, a lot more people going places, and a lot more work is being done. So, it's been fun. This is my third or fourth survey with David Keyes. So, it was fun being engaged with that and to see how it has changed and keeps moving, and how the questions that I thought were important initially, now I think we're really getting to the heart of the matter around really digging in less about finding out what everybody has, but to what are the services that people need the most. What do people need the most help with? How are we finding out what they need. I think after this survey, hopefully, we'll really have some good, actionable information. So, i think that we're getting to the heart of the point of what we're trying to get at. Instead of asking broader questions, but getting to the data. So, thank you.

**Rene Peters:**   It's funny, but I went all the way back to 2015, and I got lost on my way over here. I was thinking about sitting across the table from Vinh Tang, nervous as heck when I interviewed for my original appointment. Since then, it just been such a fun ride getting to really think about problems and things that were going on at the City level, getting to work with Seattle, getting to work with King County with folks who are so much invested into representing how we can leverage technology to make peoples' lives better. i think that this has been a fantastic experience in reestablishing that I might be somebody who in the next ten, twenty, or thirty years, is also continuing to carry the torch in thinking about how technology in all of the different ways and directions will scatter out. And how conversations like these we have here (unintelligible). So, thanks everybody for the partnership. (unintelligible) I'm still on Capitol Hill and you will see me again. Thanks, everybody.

**Brandon Lindsey:**   An anecdote: I went to the get appointed by the City Council. I think it was March 12, 2020. It was on the following Monday that the whole City shut down. Thanks to everybody that would keep serving through the last couple of years online. That means that we're not starting over on any of this. This work has continued, so that's fantastic of everybody here.

**David Keyes:**   I noticed today that we still have some red pepper flakes that were left over from pizzas served at CTAB meetings. We'll mail them to you.

**Camille Malonzo:**  I don't know about your remarks, but you don't have to ... (unintelligible)

**Lassana Magassa:**   I just wanted to add (unintelligible). I appreciate the activities that serve the community, and I look forward to continuing to work with CTAB even after my term is done. Special thanks to Brandon Lindsey and David Keyes. I worked most closely with them, and were always positive and very sincere. (unintelligible). I have admiration for the work that they do.

**Camille Malonzo:** Thank you so much, Lassana. You can't leave CTAB!

**Lassana Magassa:**   I was in Sudan and there was a conference on Appropriate Technology. it was a multi-day conference, and I was working on technology policy, starting to look at how the Sudanese work in the African continent ... (unintelligible) They are doing a lot of great important work with their resources, a humbling and inspiring (unintelligible).

**Camille Malonzo:** Awesome. Well, thank you all so much for everything. The last bit is committee updates, if we have any. We already did the year-end updates, but I just wanted to ask. Go ahead, Harte.

**COMMITTEE UPDATES**

**DIGITAL EQUITY COMMITTEE**

**Harte Daniels:**  I'm sorry. I didn't mean to cut you off. You wanted to know what we were doing in November. We were continuing that work. Okay, now this illness is catching up with me. The Tigrayan Community Association, Sound Generation, and Computing for All -- we are continuing to do that work of getting some cross-collaboration going. We did begin talking about the end of year, but also what we were looking forward to towards the new year. I gave part of that at the end of the summary for 2022.

**Camille Malonzo:**   Thanks, Harte. Did Lassana have anything for the Privacy and Cybersecurity Committee?

**PRIVACY AND CYBERSECURITY COMMITTEE**

**Lassana Magassa:**  Yes, the last meeting we started to debate on what we wanted to work on in 2023. We talked about ideas, and wanted people to join us.

**PUBLIC ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**Harte Daniels:**   A public announcement is that if you could set the date for March 29, at Seattle University, we will be presenting a documentary on healing the first people of this land. It's normally free, but they are concerned that they might not be able to fill 222 seats, but I remember helping (unintelligible) with her response to the towers coming down in 2001, she prayed and asked -- now we're more divided than ever, but then the answer that came was music. And her response to spirit was that they do not respect our culture or our songs. And the spirit answered, 'Write a symphony.' In this area, certain families own the songs. You are not allowed to sing them. So she used songs from Sealth, Chief Seattle, on healing to test the composers. And then raised the funds and presented it at Benaroya Hall with the Seattle Symphony and Seattle Opera. This is what this is about. But we also worked with her on raising funds to buy every seat in Benaroya Hall for that first presentation of the symphony. For her, the culture is a language, and language is a culture. And as you know, (unintelligible) This is her effort to show that they have a way of helping people in communicating, and helping others through this. If we can fill Benaroya Hall, I'm sure that some of you might be interested in coming on March 29, to see the documentary of that symphony. healing is what we kind of need right now in our public service area, where all of you were questioned about what you were doing, whether you're actually doing it for the rest of us. I know that you actually are. So I offer you this. Take care. That was my public announcement.

**From chat:**   Keyes, David to everyone:    7:39 PM

Mark your calendar for January 19th, 12-1pm Digital Equity Learning Network meeting. Topic is the upcoming development of digital equity plans and funding from federal to state to county. More info to come early January. <https://delnofskc.wordpress.com/>

**Camille Malonzo:**   Thank you all so much. I think with that, the meeting is adjourned. I hope you all have a wonderful end of year celebration, whatever that may be for you. And have a restful break. Stay warm. It's going to be cold.

**ADJOURNMENT**